

## V. Tibet

### *Findings*

- There has been no formal dialogue between the Dalai Lama’s representatives and Chinese Communist Party and government officials since the ninth round of dialogue was held in January 2010. The Chinese government continues to regard the Dalai Lama as a “separatist” and to reject his Middle Way approach of genuine Tibetan autonomy within China.
- The Chinese government and Communist Party have significantly tightened restrictions on access to the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) and other Tibetan areas in China for international journalists, non-governmental organizations (NGOs), foreign officials, scholars, and members of the Tibetan diaspora. Chinese authorities require all foreign visitors to the TAR to apply for a special permit. Tourists must be accompanied by government-designated tour guides and are only allowed to see controlled sites. International journalists have stated that the isolation of the TAR is worse than North Korea, allowing the Chinese government to conceal human rights abuses and environmentally damaging large-scale projects, such as river damming and mining, and to promote the claim that Tibetans benefit from and support the Party and its actions.
- The government and Party used increasingly advanced technology to intensify security and surveillance in the TAR and other Tibetan autonomous areas, and continued to use measures included in a nationwide “anti-crime and vice” campaign to crack down on Tibetans suspected of organizing or participating in activities that authorities deemed to be threatening to maintaining control or “social stability.”
- Authorities continued to restrict religious freedom in the name of “sinicization,” using policies that force religious believers to promote the Party’s agenda. Actions taken included mandatory political education for religious leaders, large-scale evictions from influential Tibetan Buddhist monasteries, and replacing visibly displayed images of Tibetan Buddhists’ spiritual leader, the Dalai Lama, with past and current Party leaders Mao Zedong and Xi Jinping.
- The Chinese government continued to pursue large-scale infrastructure and investment projects in the TAR and other Tibetan areas, including hydropower dams, mines, and the resettlement of Tibetan nomads, with no apparent representative input from the Tibetan population, independent environmental NGOs, or rights groups. These actions violate the social, economic, and cultural rights of Tibetans, such as their rights to housing and livelihood, and raised concern among environmental scientists and advocates about the regional and global impact of these projects.
- April 25, 2019, marked the 30th birthday of the Panchen Lama, **Gedun Choekyi Nyima**, whom the Dalai Lama recognized in 1995. He and his parents remain incommunicado since authorities took them into custody in May 1995. Moreover, in violation of the religious freedom of Tibetan Buddhists, the

## Tibet

government continued to promote public appearances by its chosen Panchen Lama, Gyaltzen Norbu, including his first trip abroad to Thailand, and to a sacred Tibetan Buddhist site, adding to speculation that Chinese officials will eventually attempt to use him in efforts to select the next Dalai Lama.

### *Recommendations*

Members of the U.S. Congress and Administration officials are encouraged to:

- Call on the Chinese government and Communist Party to respect—as a matter of the right to religious freedom recognized under Chinese and international law—that the decision regarding the Dalai Lama’s succession or reincarnation must be reserved for the current Dalai Lama, Tibetan Buddhist leaders, and the Tibetan people.
- Urge the Chinese government to recognize the role of restrictive Party policies and government measures, and the increasing securitization of Tibetan autonomous areas of China, in Tibetan self-immolations and protests. Urge the Chinese government to cease treating the Dalai Lama as a security threat, and stress to the government the importance of respecting and protecting Tibetan culture and language—policy changes that would promote and protect social stability in Tibetan areas.
- Encourage the Chinese government to respect the right of Tibetans to travel domestically as well as internationally, and to allow unrestricted access to Tibetan autonomous areas of China to international journalists, representatives of the United Nations and NGOs, U.S. Government officials, and members of the Tibetan diaspora living around the world.
- Call on the Chinese government to remove all restrictions on foreigners’ access to the TAR. The Administration should use existing laws to hold accountable Chinese government officials and others complicit in restricting access to the TAR, including by using the sanctions available in the Reciprocal Access to Tibet Act (Public Law No. 115–330). Encourage the Chinese government to invite independent observers with relevant expertise to assess and publicly report on the damage incurred by the February 2018 fire at the 1,300-year-old Jokhang temple in Lhasa municipality, TAR.
- Urge the Chinese government to withdraw the charges against Tibetan language rights advocate **Tashi Wangchug** and stress that peacefully advocating for genuine bilingual education—a right recognized under Chinese and international law—is not a crime.
- In interactions with Chinese officials, call for the release of Tibetan political prisoners currently detained or imprisoned for the peaceful exercise of their human rights. The records of detained Tibetans in the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database—albeit an incomplete picture of the extent of Tibetan detentions and disappearances—provide a useful resource for such interactions with Chinese officials. Urge the Chinese government and its security forces to cease using arbitrary deten-

## Tibet

tion, disappearance, beatings, torture, and intimidation to suppress and punish Tibetans' peaceful exercise of their rights.

- Urge the Chinese government to take into full account the views and preferences of Tibetans when planning infrastructure, natural resource development, settlement or resettlement projects, and tourist attractions in Tibetan areas of China.

- Continue to request that the Chinese government invite an independent representative of an international organization to meet with **Gedun Choekyi Nyima**, the 11th Panchen Lama, whom the Dalai Lama recognized in 1995, and who has been held incommunicado since May 17, 1995.

## TIBET

### *Introduction*

During the November 2018 session of the UN Human Rights Council Universal Periodic Review (UPR) of China's human rights record, the Chinese government promised to "actively participate in international cooperation in human rights,"<sup>1</sup> pledged its support for the work of UN human rights mechanisms,<sup>2</sup> and touted its legal and other actions aimed at the protection of human rights.<sup>3</sup> In contradiction to these statements, several foreign governments and international, non-governmental rights groups reported at the UPR and elsewhere that the human rights situation for Tibetans in the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) and other Tibetan areas of China had worsened in 2018.<sup>4</sup> Various stakeholders at the UPR stated that Chinese authorities had continued to violate the rights of Tibetans to freedom of religion,<sup>5</sup> movement,<sup>6</sup> association and assembly,<sup>7</sup> and expression,<sup>8</sup> as well as their cultural<sup>9</sup> and economic rights.<sup>10</sup> Rights groups documented Chinese authorities' continued oppression of Tibetans through the use of such measures as arbitrary detention,<sup>11</sup> enforced disappearances,<sup>12</sup> torture,<sup>13</sup> intrusive and increasingly sophisticated surveillance and data collection,<sup>14</sup> and the forcible resettlement of nomads.<sup>15</sup> During the Commission's 2019 reporting year, Chinese authorities used many of these measures as part of a nationwide anti-crime campaign launched in early 2018 that included the TAR and Tibetan autonomous areas.<sup>16</sup>

### *Status of Negotiations Between the Chinese Government and the Dalai Lama or His Representatives*

There has been no formal dialogue between the Dalai Lama or his representatives and the Chinese government since the ninth round of dialogue in January 2010.<sup>17</sup> The Chinese government continues to regard the Dalai Lama as a "separatist"<sup>18</sup> and to reject his Middle Way approach of genuine Tibetan autonomy within China.<sup>19</sup> Reports published this past year, including one by the Tibetan government-in-exile, rejected the Chinese government's narrative of its historical control over the TAR and other Tibetan areas.<sup>20</sup> The Central Tibetan Administration asserted that "[t]oday's continued occupation of Tibet by China . . . violates international law and the fundamental rights of the Tibetan people."<sup>21</sup> Based on this assertion, the Tibetan government-in-exile continues to call for a peaceful, negotiated resolution to the Sino-Tibetan conflict.<sup>22</sup>

### *Government and Party Policy*

#### ANTI-CRIME AND VICE CAMPAIGN IN THE TAR AND TIBETAN AREAS OF CHINA

During this reporting year, Chinese authorities continued the anti-crime and vice campaign launched in early 2018 aimed at those who allegedly threaten "political security" and "social stability."<sup>23</sup> The Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy (TCHRD) reported that Chinese authorities had intensified control and repression in Tibetan areas of China, including the criminal-

ization of ordinary social welfare activities,<sup>24</sup> and turned “Tibet into a human rights black hole.”<sup>25</sup>

The following are examples in which authorities used the anti-crime and vice campaign to further crack down in Tibetan areas of China this past year:

- According to Voice of Tibet, Chinese authorities detained “a large number” of Tibetans in Lhasa municipality, capital of the TAR.<sup>26</sup> Authorities in the TAR and other Tibetan areas reportedly posted notices asking people to inform on others suspected of involvement in such activities as “extremism,” “splittism,” “connections with the Dalai clique,” advocating “freedom to use one’s language,” “resisting land grabs, demolitions, infrastructure projects, and . . . related development projects,” and “espousing causes like economic freedom, right to livelihood, environmental protection, [and] cultural freedom,” offering cash rewards to informants in at least one county.<sup>27</sup>
- According to TCHRD and Radio Free Asia, in July 2018, public security authorities detained Tibetan villagers **Gedun Zoepa, Choegang, Bende Dorje, Tashi Tsering, Sonam Gyal, Dargye, Shawo Tsering, Khajam Gyal, and Drugbum Tsering**, all of whom are from Horgyal (Huorijia) village, Rongbo (Longwu) town, Rebgong (Tongren) county, Malho (Huangnan) Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture (TAP), Qinghai province, after they wrote a petition to reclaim village property expropriated by local government authorities.<sup>28</sup> In April 2019, the Tongren County People’s Court sentenced them to between three and seven years in prison on the charges of founding an “evil organization” and “disturb[ing] social order by mobilizing support from the public.”<sup>29</sup>

### INTENSIFYING SECURITY AND SURVEILLANCE

This reporting year, Chinese authorities reportedly continued to use “pervasive surveillance apparatus,”<sup>30</sup> including security cameras, big data centers,<sup>31</sup> artificial intelligence,<sup>32</sup> and “grid” surveillance.<sup>33</sup> Authorities also reportedly confiscated and secretly installed surveillance apps on Tibetans’ mobile phones.<sup>34</sup>

The following examples illustrate Chinese authorities’ efforts to tighten control in Tibetan areas of China:

- In July 2018, authorities **displaced over 200 monks** under the age of 18 from at least two monasteries in Kardze (Ganzi) county, Kardze (Ganzi) TAP, Sichuan province, and **forced them instead to attend government-run schools.**<sup>35</sup>
- In September 2018, Tibet University and Wise-web Technology Company jointly **launched a big data center to track the real-time activities of tourists.**<sup>36</sup> The Party-run Global Times, citing a professor at Minzu University in Beijing municipality, noted that “developing tourism in Tibet is also an important move to safeguard regional stability, promote national unity, and guard against separatist forces.”<sup>37</sup>
- In October 2018, Party officials **opened a new “political education camp”** in Shigatse (Rikaze) municipality, TAR, to provide training in Party ideology and policies for officials

## Tibet

throughout the municipality, with a particular focus on work related to “grassroots Party building” and “anti-separatism.”<sup>38</sup>

- Prior to the 60th anniversary of the 1959 Tibetan uprising on March 10, 2019, Chinese authorities **closed the TAR to foreign visitors for two months,**<sup>39</sup> **restricted inter-regional travel by Tibetans,**<sup>40</sup> **and added facial recognition, big data analysis, and upgraded GPS tracking devices in taxi cabs to monitor drivers.**<sup>41</sup>

- Following the passage of the Reciprocal Access to Tibet Act (RATA) by the U.S. Government in December 2018,<sup>42</sup> TAR authorities announced plans to speed up the process for obtaining the special permit required of foreigners to visit the TAR.<sup>43</sup> In March 2019, the State Department reported that **the Chinese government “systematically impeded travel”** by U.S. diplomats, officials, journalists, and tourists to Tibetan areas in 2018.<sup>44</sup>

- In April 2019, Radio Free Asia reported that **authorities closed enrollment at Larung Gar Buddhist Institute** in Serthar (Seda) county, Kardze (Ganzi) TAP, Sichuan, after having recently built walls and checkpoints to prevent entry, while keeping monks and nuns under **strict surveillance.**<sup>45</sup>

In summer 2016, authorities began demolishing homes and forcibly expelling monks and nuns from Larung Gar, in an effort to reduce their numbers from around 10,000 to 5,000.<sup>46</sup>

- From May to July 2019, authorities **forcibly evicted an estimated 3,500 monks and nuns from Yachen Gar,** a major Tibetan Buddhist institute in Palyul (Baiyu) county, Kardze (Ganzi) TAP, Sichuan.<sup>47</sup> In July, authorities **demolished at least 100 dwellings** of recently evicted nuns, despite appeals by senior monks to authorities.<sup>48</sup>

### *Religious Freedom for Tibetan Buddhists*

#### REINCARNATION AND THE SELECTION OF THE 15TH DALAI LAMA

As the 14th Dalai Lama, Tenzin Gyatso, turned 84 years old on July 6, 2019,<sup>49</sup> his advancing age continued to fuel discussion about his succession.<sup>50</sup> The Chinese government continued to claim the authority to manage the selection and education of his successor through the state-controlled Buddhist Association of China,<sup>51</sup> stating that “reincarnation of living Buddhas including the Dalai Lama must comply with Chinese laws and regulations and follow religious rituals and historical conventions.”<sup>52</sup> In July 2019, a Party official in the TAR said that the Dalai Lama’s reincarnation “must be recognized by the central government,” and that the reincarnation would not be “decided by his personal wish or by some group of people living in other countries.”<sup>53</sup> The government’s position violates international standards of religious freedom, which guarantee the right of religious communities “to train, appoint, elect or designate by succession appropriate leaders.”<sup>54</sup> The Dalai Lama has stated that the Chinese Communist Party, which rejects belief in reincarnation, has no authority or role in the recognition of reincarnated Lamas.<sup>55</sup> Furthermore, he said that anyone chosen by the Party would not be accepted by Tibetan Bud-

dhists,<sup>56</sup> reiterating this position in a March 2019 interview with international media outlet Reuters.<sup>57</sup>

April 25, 2019, marked the 30th birthday of **Gedun Choekyi Nyima**, whom the Dalai Lama recognized as the Panchen Lama in 1995.<sup>58</sup> He and his family remain incommunicado since authorities abducted them in May 1995.<sup>59</sup> The Chinese government's chosen Panchen Lama, Gyaltzen Norbu, continued to appear in public, including at the sacred Buddhist site Lhamo Latso lake in Lhokha (Shannan) municipality, Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR), in August 2018,<sup>60</sup> and made his first trip abroad to Thailand in May 2019, where he reportedly praised the "greatness" of the Chinese Communist Party.<sup>61</sup>

#### "SINICIZATION" OF TIBETAN BUDDHISM

During this reporting year, Chinese authorities issued directives that curtailed previously tolerated religious practices under the national "Sinicization of Religion" policy promoted by President Xi Jinping beginning in April 2016.<sup>62</sup> Such directives contravene the freedom of religious belief guaranteed in China's Constitution<sup>63</sup> and violate the right to freedom of religion defined in international human rights instruments, such as the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.<sup>64</sup>

The Commission observed the following violations of Tibetan Buddhists' right to religious freedom in this reporting year:

- **Promotion of the Sinicization of Tibetan Buddhism.**

Authorities held a seminar in Sichuan province in October 2018 to discuss the "adaptation of Tibetan Buddhism to socialist society."<sup>65</sup> At a symposium in Qinghai province that same day, one of the major topics of discussion for monks and scholars was "how Buddhism could better serve China's Belt and Road Initiative."<sup>66</sup>

- **Cancellation of a major prayer festival at Larung Gar.**

In October 2018, authorities canceled the weeklong Dechen Shingdrup festival at Larung Gar Buddhist Institute, in Serthar (Seda) county, Kardze (Ganzi) Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture (TAP), Sichuan province, for the third consecutive year.<sup>67</sup>

- **Forced removal of photos of the 14th Dalai Lama from temples and homes.**

In December 2018, authorities in Dzoerge Toema (Zuogeduoma) township, Tsoe (Hezuo) city, Kanlho (Gannan) TAP, Gansu province, reportedly announced a "Specialized Cleanup of the 14th Dalai Lama's Portraits," requiring locals to replace pictures of the Dalai Lama with portraits of former Party Chairman Mao Zedong and current Party General Secretary Xi Jinping.<sup>68</sup> Following the Dalai Lama's birthday in July 2019, police in Palyul (Baiyu) county, Kardze (Ganzi) TAP, Sichuan, reportedly beat Tibetan residents in two subsidized resettlement communities for displaying photos of the Dalai Lama in their homes.<sup>69</sup> Public security officials also reportedly detained several individuals who had burnt incense and offered prayers on his birthday.<sup>70</sup>

- **Mandatory political education for monks and nuns.**

In December 2018, the TAR Party Committee announced that all religious personnel and officials must attend a three- to five-

## Tibet

year political education workshop.<sup>71</sup> In March 2019, Chinese official sources reported that authorities required 30,000 monks to take exams on Chinese laws and regulations, including the PRC Anti-Terrorism Law and the PRC Counter-espionage Law.”<sup>72</sup>

- **Restrictions on religious education.** In December 2018, authorities in Nangchen (Nangqian) county, Yulshul (Yushu) TAP, Qinghai province, banned classes offered by monks, proscribing them as “ideological infiltration among the young,” “dangerous,” and “harmful.”<sup>73</sup>

- **Forced acts of worship of Chinese leaders.** In January 2019, authorities in Serthar (Seda) county, Kardze (Ganzi) TAP, Sichuan, reportedly forced Tibetans to prostrate and make offerings before pictures of Chinese Communist Party leaders, including Xi Jinping.<sup>74</sup> A January report disclosed that in May 2018, authorities also had ordered Lhasa municipality residents, some of whom are dependent on state assistance due to previous government land seizures, to stop worshipping the Buddha or risk losing their subsidies.<sup>75</sup>

### *Self-Immolation*

At least two self-immolations as a form of protest occurred in Tibetan autonomous areas of China this past year.<sup>76</sup> According to Tibetan advocacy groups, Chinese government suppression of Tibetans’ freedoms of expression and religion have led some Tibetans to turn to self-immolation as protest.<sup>77</sup> According to the International Campaign for Tibet and the Central Tibetan Administration (the Tibetan government-in-exile located in Dharamsala, India), more than 150 Tibetans have self-immolated since 2009, with many calling for the long life of the Dalai Lama, his return from exile, and freedom for Tibet.<sup>78</sup>

The Commission observed the following cases of Tibetans who self-immolated as a form of protest:

- On November 4, 2018, a 23-year-old man named **Dopo** (or Dorbe) reportedly died after self-immolating in Ngaba (Aba) county, Ngaba (Aba) Tibetan and Qiang Autonomous Prefecture (T&QAP), Sichuan province, while shouting wishes to see the Dalai Lama and for his long life.<sup>79</sup> Radio Free Asia also reported that authorities quickly controlled the scene and refused to provide further information.<sup>80</sup>

- On December 8, 2018, a former monk in his twenties named **Drugkho**, previously known as **Choekyi Gyaltzen**,<sup>81</sup> from Soruma (Suorima) village, Choejema (Qiujiema) township, Ngaba county, reportedly self-immolated in Ngaba county while shouting for the Dalai Lama’s long life and freedom for Tibet.<sup>82</sup> According to one Tibetan advocacy organization, Drugkho reportedly survived.<sup>83</sup>

Following these two self-immolations, authorities increased security measures in the area, including reportedly blocking internet communications.<sup>84</sup>



*Status of Tibetan Culture and Language*

The Chinese government’s National Human Rights Action Plan (2016–2020) provides both that “the cultural rights of ethnic minorities shall be guaranteed” and that “[t]he right of ethnic minorities to learn, use and develop their own spoken and written languages shall be respected and guaranteed,” echoing provisions of China’s Constitution, the PRC Regional Ethnic Autonomy Law, and the PRC Education Law.<sup>85</sup> In March 2019, the State Council Information Office released the white paper, “Democratic Reform in Tibet—Sixty Years On,” which featured two aims regarding Tibetan language: “While protecting and developing the Tibetan language, the state is promoting . . . standard Chinese across the country, including [in] Tibet . . .”<sup>86</sup> In contradiction to the stated aim to protect and develop the Tibetan language, authorities continued to restrict access to Tibetan language education and suppress Tibetan language education advocacy this past year:

- According to Radio Free Asia, in December 2018, Chinese authorities restricted Tibetan language classes for children at monasteries in Nangchen (Nangqian) county, Yulshul (Yushu) TAP, Qinghai province.<sup>87</sup>
- In January 2019, authorities at Dongchuan Prison in Xining municipality, Qinghai, reportedly barred a lawyer from meeting with Tibetan language education advocate **Tashi Wangchug** (Tashi Wangchuk), whom the Yushu TAP Intermediate People’s Court in Yushu, Qinghai, sentenced to five years in prison in May 2018 on the charge of “inciting separatism.”<sup>88</sup> By blocking this meeting, authorities effectively denied him his right to proceed with a criminal petition (*shensu*).<sup>89</sup> In August 2019, prison authorities again barred lawyers from meeting with him, despite their submission of required documents.<sup>90</sup>

*Freedom of Expression*

The U.S. State Department and the international non-governmental organization Human Rights Watch reported in 2019 that the Chinese government continued to restrict freedom of speech and assembly in the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) and Tibetan areas of China.<sup>91</sup> According to the State Department, “The Chinese government harassed or detained Tibetans as punishment for speaking to foreigners, attempting to provide information to persons abroad, or communicating information regarding protests . . .”<sup>92</sup> The State Department also reported that authorities had restricted internet service “for weeks or months at a time” during times deemed to be politically sensitive or times of unrest, and threatened Tibetans with prison sentences for sharing videos or information about self-immolations.<sup>93</sup> A Tibetan researcher reported that Chinese authorities had “crack[ed] down hard on [social media platform] WeChat users who demonstrate sympathy and support for the Tibetan cause,” including the use of “restrictions and fines.”<sup>94</sup>

Representative examples of violations of Tibetans’ right to free expression this past year include:

## Tibet

- In September 2018, authorities in Kyangche (Jiangqian) township, Gade (Gande) county, Golog (Guoluo) TAP, Qinghai, reportedly beat and detained **Sengdra**, a Tibetan advocate known for his campaign against corruption, on suspicion of “picking quarrels and provoking trouble.”<sup>95</sup>
- In September 2018, authorities in Ngaba (Aba) county, Ngaba (Aba) Tibetan and Qiang Autonomous Prefecture, Sichuan province, reportedly detained **Tenzin Geleg**, an 18-year-old monk from Ngaba’s Kirti Monastery, after he conducted a solo protest calling for freedom for Tibet.<sup>96</sup> In the same month, authorities also reportedly detained 23-year-old monk **Dorje Rabten** and another unidentified monk, both also from Kirti, after they staged solo protests.<sup>97</sup>

On December 10, 2018, authorities in Ngaba reportedly severely beat and detained **Sanggye Gyatso**, a 16- or 17-year-old monk also from Kirti Monastery, as he staged a solo protest calling for “Freedom for Tibet.”<sup>98</sup>

- On April 29, 2019, public security officials in Sershul (Shiqu) county, Kardze (Ganzi) TAP, Sichuan, detained four Tibetan men in connection with one of them, **Wangchen**, praying and reportedly shouting slogans calling for the release of the 11th Panchen Lama, despite warnings from other monks of possible arrest by police.<sup>99</sup> In May, a court sentenced Wangchen to four years and six months in prison for leading an illegal public protest.<sup>100</sup> On May 2, authorities detained his aunt **Drolkar**, and later that month sentenced her to one year and three months’ imprisonment for sharing information about the protest.<sup>101</sup>
- During this reporting year, the Commission did not observe further news about the large **February 2018 fire at the Jokhang temple** in Lhasa municipality, TAR, one of Tibetan Buddhism’s holiest sites and a UNESCO World Heritage site.<sup>102</sup> An international advocacy organization used satellite imagery analysis to show that the fire did more damage than the government reported, and cited commentators who criticized the government’s failure to report the severity of the damage.<sup>103</sup> Authorities also reportedly censored the online sharing of information about the fire.<sup>104</sup> Neither Chinese media reports on activities at the Jokhang in April 2019 nor an international media report on U.S. Ambassador to China Terry Branstad’s visit to the temple in May 2019 mentioned the fire, resulting damage, or repair efforts.<sup>105</sup>
- In April 2019, authorities reportedly detained Tibetan graduate student **Sonam Lhundrub** at Northwest Minzu University in Lanzhou municipality, Gansu province, after he posted an essay on social media criticizing the decline in opportunities to obtain government jobs for Tibetans in Tibetan areas.<sup>106</sup>

### *Freedom of Movement*

The Chinese government continued to restrict Tibetans’ freedom of movement in violation of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, which articulates the rights of every person to “liberty of movement and freedom to choose his residence”; “free-

dom to leave any country, including his own”; and “the right to enter his own country.”<sup>107</sup> Authorities tightened borders in Tibetan regions and restricted Tibetans’ ability to travel abroad.<sup>108</sup>

The Commission observed the following restrictions on Tibetans’ movement and travel this past year:

- According to TCHRD’s 2018 annual report, authorities required Tibetan visitors to Lhasa from Tibetan areas outside the TAR to surrender their ID cards and obtain special permits to enter the city, and to undergo close searches and frisking at checkpoints in order to visit the Jokhang temple.<sup>109</sup>
- Tibetans wishing to travel abroad, especially for pilgrimage to India for the Dalai Lama’s annual teachings at Bodh Gaya, India in December 2018, faced barriers in obtaining passports.<sup>110</sup> Authorities reportedly subjected Tibetan travelers to a “two-track” passport system,<sup>111</sup> long interrogations, and cancellation of passports or denial of permission to travel at airports without refunds.<sup>112</sup> Authorities had also reportedly confiscated and destroyed the passports of returning Tibetan pilgrims after the 2018 annual teachings.<sup>113</sup>
- The U.S. State Department reported that the “People’s Armed Police (PAP) and local public security bureaus (PSB) set up roadblocks and checkpoints in Tibetan areas . . . especially around sensitive dates”<sup>114</sup> and that authorities required monks and nuns to undergo “extra scrutiny . . . at roadside checkpoints and at airports.”<sup>115</sup>
- According to TCHRD, in 2018, Chinese authorities in Rebgong (Tongren) county, Malho (Huangnan) TAP, Qinghai, informed a Tibetan refugee visiting from India that, as of January 2018, Tibetans returning to China were not allowed to permanently reside in their hometowns.<sup>116</sup> TCHRD found no evidence that the statement was connected to any formal policy.<sup>117</sup>

### *Economy, Environment, and Development Concerns*

- **Economy.** According to the Office of the UN High Commissioner for Human Rights summary of rights groups’ submissions in advance of the November 2018 session of the UN Human Rights Council’s Universal Periodic Review (UPR) of China, the Chinese government’s “large-scale infrastructure and investment projects in Tibet . . . often resulted in violations of Tibetan’s [sic] economic, social, and cultural rights, such as their rights to livelihood and to adequate housing.”<sup>118</sup>
- **Environment.** The Chinese government has designated large areas in the TAR and Qinghai province as national parks, and has relocated Tibetans for the stated purposes of protecting ecosystems and improving the livelihoods of local residents.<sup>119</sup> Tibetan groups state, however, that government claims about the need to protect the environment are also used as a pretext to forcibly resettle Tibetans from traditional grazing lands.<sup>120</sup> Scientists and Tibetan groups note that many government actions on the Tibetan Plateau exacerbate climate change, resulting in glacial melting, permafrost degradation, and desertification of grasslands.<sup>121</sup>

## Tibet

- **Water rights.** Many of Asia's major rivers originate on the Tibetan Plateau, known as the "Third Pole" and "water tower of Asia."<sup>122</sup> A Tibet researcher argued that the government's dams and water diversion projects on many of Asia's rivers violate the water rights of Tibetans and over 1.3 billion people in downstream countries who are dependent on these rivers for drinking water and agriculture.<sup>123</sup>

- **Development.** The Chinese government continued to forcibly resettle Tibetans throughout the TAR and other Tibetan areas of China for the stated purposes of development and poverty alleviation.<sup>124</sup> Between January and May 2019, Radio Free Asia reported the following:

- Authorities forced Tibetan nomadic families in Chamdo (Changdu) municipality, TAR, to move into towns and pay nearly 8,000 yuan (US\$1,165) for their new homes.<sup>125</sup>
- Authorities removed 12 families from Gonjo (Gongjue) county, Chamdo, and relocated them to Nyingchi (Linzhi) municipality, TAR.<sup>126</sup>
- Nomadic families who were forcibly resettled several years ago to an area east of Chengguan district, Lhasa municipality, TAR, were suffering financial and other hardships due to the loss of their livelihoods and the failure of authorities to provide promised assistance.<sup>127</sup>
- Authorities resettled around 40 Tibetan families from their village in Qinghai for airport construction.<sup>128</sup>

Some attempts by Tibetans to oppose development projects have led to violence against or detention of protesters. Observers reported the following:

- On September 11, 2018, authorities detained five monks at **Gomang Monastery** in Ngaba (Aba) county, Ngaba (Aba) Tibetan and Qiang Autonomous Prefecture, Sichuan province, for protesting a residential construction project near the monastery.<sup>129</sup>
- On October 11, 2018, Han Chinese workers reportedly attacked Tibetans who were protesting their work installing solar panels on grazing land in Chabcha (Gonghe) county, Tsolho (Hainan) Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture, Qinghai.<sup>130</sup>

#### Notes to Section V—Tibet

<sup>1</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review—China, A/HRC/40/6, December 26, 2018, para. 17.

<sup>2</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>3</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Report of the Working Group on the Universal Periodic Review—China, A/HRC/40/6, December 26, 2018, paras. 7, 8, 12, 13. See also *PRC Constitution*, passed and effective December 4, 1982 (amended March 11, 2018), art. 33.

<sup>4</sup> Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 9; Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor, U.S. Department of State, “Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2018—China (Includes Tibet, Hong Kong, and Macau),” March 13, 2019, 2; International Federation for Human Rights and International Campaign for Tibet, “China: Dramatic Deterioration of Human Rights Situation in Tibet Detailed in Report for UN Review,” March 29, 2018.

<sup>5</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018, para. 65; *PRC Constitution*, passed and effective December 4, 1982 (amended March 11, 2018), art. 36.

<sup>6</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018, paras. 64, 67.

<sup>7</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 64.

<sup>8</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 17.

<sup>9</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018, para. 65; *PRC Constitution*, passed and effective December 4, 1982 (amended March 11, 2018), art. 4.

<sup>10</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018, para. 12.

<sup>11</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018, para. 65; *PRC Constitution*, passed and effective December 4, 1982 (amended March 11, 2018), art. 37.

<sup>12</sup> “Zhonggong dangju yu Xizang Lasa ‘Saohei Chu’e’ zhongjin youhuo Zangren xuxiang jiefa” [Chinese Communist Party authorities in Lhasa, Tibet’s “Anti-Crime and Evil Campaign” use large sums to entice Tibetans to expose each other], *Voice of Tibet*, May 23, 2019.

<sup>13</sup> UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018, para. 65.

<sup>14</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 5.

<sup>15</sup> *Ibid.*, para. 12.

<sup>16</sup> Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 9; Weida Li, “China to Begin Nationwide Crackdown on Organised Crime,” *Global Times*, January 25, 2018.

<sup>17</sup> U.S. Department of State, “2019 Report to Congress on Tibet Negotiations, Department of State Authorities Act, Fiscal Year 2017 Improvements Act PL 115–94, Sec. 13,” June 3, 2019, attached to letter from Mary Elizabeth Taylor, Assistant Secretary, Bureau of Legislative Affairs, U.S. Department of State, to United States Senate, Committee on Foreign Relations, May 30, 2019, 1.

<sup>18</sup> Zhu Weiqun, “Daogui shu’ wan bu hui Dalai jitian shibai mingyun” [“Mischief-making” will not prevent the failure of the Dalai clique], *Global Times*, October 19, 2018; “Tibet Vows to Fight against Separatism,” *Xinhua*, January 10, 2019; State Council Information Office, “Tibet’s Path of Development Is Driven by an Irresistible Historical Tide,” April 15, 2015, sec. V.

<sup>19</sup> State Council Information Office, “Tibet’s Path of Development Is Driven by an Irresistible Historical Tide,” April 15, 2015, Conclusion; Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibet Was Never a Part of China, but the Middle Way Approach Remains a Viable Solution,” October 2018, 120; Sherab Wooser, Office of His Holiness the Dalai Lama, “I Am Not Seeking Independence, Reconfirms His Holiness,” November 3, 2009.

<sup>20</sup> Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibet Was Never a Part of China, but the Middle Way Approach Remains a Viable Solution,” October 2018, title page, 40–41, 42, 66, 239; Michael van Walt van Praag and Miek Boltjes, “Speaking Truth to Power Regarding China’s Claim to Tibet: Working Paper Prepared for the 7th World Parliamentarians’ Convention on Tibet,” Riga, Latvia, May 8, 2019, 55–57.

<sup>21</sup> Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibet Was Never a Part of China, but the Middle Way Approach Remains a Viable Solution,” October 2018, 37. See also Michael van Walt van Praag and Miek Boltjes, “Speaking Truth to Power Regarding China’s Claim to Tibet: Working Paper Prepared for the 7th World Parliamentarians’ Convention on Tibet,” Riga, Latvia, May 8, 2019, 55–57. On May 16, 2019, van Walt van Praag presented a detailed analysis and refutation of the Chinese government’s historical claim that Tibet was always an integral part of China, and argued that the virtually unchallenged international acceptance of this notion removes the possibility of equal footing for negotiations and undermines the prospect of a satisfactory resolution to the Sino-Tibetan conflict.

<sup>22</sup> Tibetan Parliament in Exile, Riga Declaration, adopted by the 7th World Parliamentarians’ Convention on Tibet, May 14, 2019.

<sup>23</sup> CCP Central Committee and State Council, *Guanyu Kaizhan Saohei Chu’e Zhuanxiang Douzheng De Tongzhi* [Circular on the Specialized Struggle to Sweep Away Organized Crime and Eliminate Vice], January 24, 2018; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *An-*

## Tibet

*nual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 9; Weida Li, “China to Begin Nationwide Crackdown on Organised Crime,” *Global Times*, January 25, 2018; Xu Wei, “Chengchu hei e shili fanzui yao da zhun da hen” [Black and evil forces and crimes must be ruthlessly punished], *People’s Daily*, February 1, 2018.

<sup>24</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 13.

<sup>25</sup>*Ibid.*, 9.

<sup>26</sup>“Zhonggong dangju yu Xizang Lasa ‘saohei chu’e’ zhongjin youhuo Zangren xuxiang jiefu” [Chinese Communist Party authorities in Lhasa, Tibet’s “Anti-Crime and Evil Campaign” use large sums to entice Tibetans to expose each other], *Voice of Tibet*, May 23, 2019.

<sup>27</sup>“Zhonggong dangju yu Xizang Lasa ‘saohei chu’e’ zhongjin youhuo Zangren xianghu jiefu” [Chinese Communist Party authorities in Lhasa, Tibet’s “Anti-Crime and Evil Campaign” use large sums to entice Tibetans to expose each other], *Voice of Tibet*, May 23, 2019; Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor, U.S. Department of State, “Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2018—China (Includes Tibet, Hong Kong, and Macau),” March 13, 2019, 78; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 11–12.

<sup>28</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, “Nine Tibetans Sentenced Up to 7 Years in Prison under China’s Organised Crime Crackdown,” April 19, 2019; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, “Zhongguo ‘Saohei Chu’e’ Zhuaxiang Douzheng’ xia 9 ming Zangren bei panchu 7 nian deng tuxing” [Under China’s “Specialized Struggle to Sweep Away Organized Crime and Eliminate Vice,” 9 Tibetans sentenced to up to 7 years], April 19, 2019; “Nine Tibetans Are Jailed in Rebong for Running an ‘Illegal Organization’ Claiming Land Rights,” *Radio Free Asia*, April 23, 2019.

<sup>29</sup>Tongren County People’s Court, “Tongren Xian Renmin Fayuan gongkai kaiting shenli ‘khangowa’ e shili fanzui jitan anjian” [Tongren County People’s Court holds open trial in “khangowa” evil forces criminal gang case], April 16, 2019.

<sup>30</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 5.

<sup>31</sup>Tenzin Tsultrim, “Big Brother Really Is Watching: China’s Grand Plan for Smart Surveillance in Tibet,” *Hong Kong Free Press*, March 31, 2019; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 5; Claude Arpi, “Big Data near the Indian Border,” *Claude Arpi* (blog), December 29, 2018.

<sup>32</sup>Tenzin Tsultrim, “Big Brother Really Is Watching: China’s Grand Plan for Smart Surveillance in Tibet,” *Hong Kong Free Press*, March 31, 2019; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 5; Claude Arpi, “Big Data near the Indian Border,” *Claude Arpi* (blog), December 29, 2018.

<sup>33</sup>International Campaign for Tibet, “China’s Control State in Lhasa—The Black Box of Tibet’s Prison System: Detention Center Notorious for Torture next to 5-Star Global Brand Hotel,” October 3, 2018. “Grid-style social management”—a central government “securitization” policy first deployed in the Tibet Autonomous Region in 2012—divides urban and rural areas into smaller units for the purpose of intensifying surveillance, policing, and control at the community level. Human Rights Watch, “China: Alarming New Surveillance, Security in Tibet,” March 20, 2013; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2017—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 7, 2018, 8; Adrian Zenz and James Leibold, “Chen Quanguo: The Strongman behind Beijing’s Securitization Strategy in Tibet and Xinjiang,” *China Brief*, Jamestown Foundation, September 21, 2017. See also “Grid Locked,” *Economist*, June 22, 2013.

<sup>34</sup>Tenzin Dalha, “How WeChat Conquered Tibet,” *The Diplomat*, July 16, 2019.

<sup>35</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 36. See also International Campaign for Tibet, “China Forces Young Tibetan Monks Out of Monastery into Government-Run School as Part of Drive to Replace Monastic Education with Political Propaganda,” July 12, 2018.

<sup>36</sup>Cao Siqi, “Big Data System Keeps Real-Time Track of Visitors in Tibet,” *Global Times*, October 7, 2018.

<sup>37</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>38</sup>Wang Yufei, “Rikaze shi kaishe ‘zhengzhi jiaoyu xunlian ying’” [Shigatse municipality opens “political education training camp”], *Tibet Daily*, January 22, 2019; “China Sets Up Camp in Tibet’s Shigatse to Train Party Workers in ‘Correct Thought’: Report,” *Radio Free Asia*, February 14, 2019.

<sup>39</sup>International Campaign for Tibet, “China Bans Foreigners from Visiting Tibet Autonomous Region until April,” February 19, 2019.

<sup>40</sup>“Chinese Authorities Tighten Restrictions in Qinghai amid Tibetan Uprising Anniversaries,” *Radio Free Asia*, March 14, 2019.

<sup>41</sup>Free Tibet, “China Installed New Surveillance in Tibet Ahead of 1959 Anniversary,” March 13, 2019; “Lhasa Uses Facial Recognition, Big Data Analysis in New Taxis,” *Global Times*, March 5, 2019.

<sup>42</sup>Reciprocal Access to Tibet Act of 2018, Pub. L. No. 115–330.

<sup>43</sup>“China Pledges Easier Access to Tibet for Foreign Tourists after US Pressure,” *Reuters*, January 11, 2019; “Tibet Travel to Become Easier for Foreigners,” *CGTN*, January 14, 2019.

<sup>44</sup>U.S. Department of State, “Report to Congress on Section 4 of the Reciprocal Access to Tibet Act of 2018 of P.L. 115–330,” March 25, 2019.

<sup>45</sup>“Larung Gar Buddhist Academy Closes to New Enrollment as China Tightens Controls,” *Radio Free Asia*, April 19, 2019.

<sup>46</sup>International Campaign for Tibet, “Demolitions Begin at Larung Gar, ‘A Monastery for the World,’ as Religious Teachers Urge Calm,” July 25, 2016; Human Rights Watch, “China: Major Tibetan Buddhist Institution Faces Further Demolitions,” March 29, 2017; “Larung Gar Expulsions Now Complete: Local Source,” *Radio Free Asia*, April 7, 2017. See also CECC, *2018 Annual*

## Tibet

Report, October 10, 2018, 294; CECC, *2017 Annual Report*, October 5, 2017, 303–4; CECC, *2016 Annual Report*, October 6, 2016, 303–4.

<sup>47</sup>“Thousands of Monks, Nuns Evicted from Sichuan’s Yachen Gar,” *Radio Free Asia*, June 11, 2019. For more information on Yachen Gar (Yarchen Gar), see CECC, *2017 Annual Report*, October 5, 2017, 304.

<sup>48</sup>“Large-Scale Demolition Begins at Sichuan’s Yachen Gar Tibetan Buddhist Center,” *Radio Free Asia*, July 29, 2019; “Photo Shows Dramatic Demolition of Yachen Gar Buddhist Complex,” *Radio Free Asia*, August 28, 2019.

<sup>49</sup>Office of His Holiness the Dalai Lama, “Thank You from His Holiness,” July 10, 2019.

<sup>50</sup>Krishna N. Das and Sunil Kataria, “Exclusive: Dalai Lama Contemplates Chinese Gambit after His Death,” *Reuters*, March 18, 2019; Yonden Lhatoo, “China and the Dalai Lama Play Endgame for Tibet, and It’s Going to Be an Unholy Mess,” *South China Morning Post*, March 30, 2019; Jessica Batke, “Is This the Last Dalai Lama?,” *ChinaFile*, Asia Society, March 15, 2019.

<sup>51</sup>“The Religious Ritual and Historical Convention of Living Buddha Reincarnation,” *China Tibet Online*, January 24, 2019; State Council Information Office, “Tibet’s Path of Development Is Driven by an Irresistible Historical Tide,” April 15, 2015, sec. V.

<sup>52</sup>State Administration for Religious Affairs, *Zangchuan Fojiao Huofo Zhuanshi Guanli Banfa* [Measures on the Management of the Reincarnation of Living Buddhas in Tibetan Buddhism], issued July 13, 2007, effective September 1, 2007, arts. 5–11; Ministry of Foreign Affairs, “Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Geng Shuang’s Regular Press Conference on March 19, 2019,” March 19, 2019; Embassy of the People’s Republic of China in the Hellenic Republic, “Foreign Ministry Spokesperson Lu Kang’s Regular Press Conference on April 10, 2019,” April 11, 2019; “The Religious Ritual and Historical Convention of Living Buddha Reincarnation,” *China Tibet Online*, January 24, 2019; State Council Information Office, “Tibet’s Path of Development Is Driven by an Irresistible Historical Tide,” April 15, 2015, sec. V. By “historical conventions,” Chinese authorities are referring to practices during the Qing dynasty (1644–1911) and the Republican era (1912–1949) when those governments recognized the current 14th Dalai Lama (in 1940) and previous Dalai Lamas.

<sup>53</sup>Manash Pratim Bhuyan, “Next Dalai Lama Must Be Chosen within China; India Should Not Intervene: Chinese Authorities,” *Press Trust of India*, reprinted in *India Today*, July 14, 2019; Elizabeth Roche, “Selection of the Next Dalai Lama May Test New Delhi-Beijing Ties,” *Livemint*, July 15, 2019.

<sup>54</sup>Declaration on the Elimination of All Forms of Intolerance and of Discrimination Based on Religion or Belief, proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 36/55 of November 25, 1981, art. 6(g); UN Human Rights Committee, General Comment 22, Article 18 (Forty-eighth session, 1993). Compilation of General Comments and General Recommendations Adopted by Human Rights Treaty Bodies, HRI/GEN/1/Rev.1 (July 29, 1994), para. 4. See also International Campaign for Tibet, “China’s Response to Dalai Lama Reincarnation Statements Shows Beijing’s Insecurity and Lack of Legitimacy,” March 20, 2019.

<sup>55</sup>Office of His Holiness the Dalai Lama, “Reincarnation,” September 24, 2011. See also Jessica Batke, “Is This the Last Dalai Lama?,” *ChinaFile*, Asia Society, March 15, 2019.

<sup>56</sup>Office of His Holiness the Dalai Lama, “Reincarnation,” September 24, 2011.

<sup>57</sup>Krishna N. Das and Sunil Kataria, “Exclusive: Dalai Lama Contemplates Chinese Gambit after His Death,” *Reuters*, March 18, 2019.

<sup>58</sup>“The Panchen Lama Turns 30, 24 Years after He Disappeared,” *AsiaNews*, April 26, 2019; Tenzin Dorjee, U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom (USCIRF), “Open Letter from USCIRF Chair Tenzin Dorjee to the Panchen Lama on His 30th Birthday,” April 25, 2019. For more information on Gedun Choekyi Nyima, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2004-00835.

<sup>59</sup>“The Panchen Lama Turns 30, 24 Years After He Disappeared,” *AsiaNews*, April 26, 2019; Tenzin Dorjee, U.S. Commission on International Religious Freedom (USCIRF), “Open Letter from USCIRF Chair Tenzin Dorjee to the Panchen Lama on His 30th Birthday,” April 25, 2019.

<sup>60</sup>International Campaign for Tibet, “China Tightens Screws on Tibetan Buddhism,” September 11, 2018. For more information on the Panchen Lama and the Chinese government’s likely model for selecting the next Dalai Lama, see CECC, *2008 Annual Report*, October 31, 2008, 189.

<sup>61</sup>“China Says Its Panchen Lama Made First Trip outside Country in May,” *Reuters*, June 11, 2019.

<sup>62</sup>Wang Zuo’an, “Yinling zongjiao zhongguohua jincheng xing wen zhi yuan” [Leading religion in the stable and long-term process of sinicization], *China Ethnic News*, March 26, 2019; John Dotson, “Propaganda Themes at the CPPCC Stress the ‘Sinicization’ of Religion,” *China Brief*, Jamestown Foundation, April 9, 2019; Charlotte Gao, “Chinese Communist Party Vows to ‘Sinicize Religions’ in China,” *The Diplomat*, October 24, 2017. For more background on the “sinicization” of religions, see CECC, “Freedom of Religion” in *2018 Annual Report*, October 10, 2018, 121–24; CECC, *2017 Annual Report*, October 5, 2017, 129 (text box titled “Revisions to the Regulations on Religious Affairs”). In a March 2019 article in the state-run *China Ethnic News*, director of the State Administration for Religious Affairs and vice-minister of the United Front Work Department Wang Zuo’an reiterated the “four perseverances” in guiding religions “to sinicize” (*zhongguohua*), a process the Party defines as adapting to socialist society under its leadership (the literal meaning of *zhongguohua* is “to make [something] Chinese,” without specific Party or ideological connotations). The “four perseverances” comprise: 1) following the leadership of the Party; 2) awakening religious circles to their duty and mission to contribute to the great project of “building socialism with Chinese characteristics”; 3) “classifying and leading” each religion according to its characteristics such as upholding the concept of “humanistic Buddhism”; and 4) seeking “long-term success” in guiding religion through the complexities and changes of history.

## Tibet

<sup>63</sup> PRC Constitution, passed and effective December 4, 1982 (amended March 11, 2018), art. 36.

<sup>64</sup> Universal Declaration of Human Rights, adopted and proclaimed by UN General Assembly resolution 217A (III) of December 10, 1948, art. 18.

<sup>65</sup> “Wo sheng juban Zang chuan Fojiao yu shehuizhuyi shehui xiang shiying yantaohui” [[Sichuan] Province holds conference on the adaptation of Tibetan Buddhism to socialist society], *Sichuan Daily*, reprinted in *Sichuan Online*, October 18, 2018.

<sup>66</sup> Zhang Han, “Buddhism Encouraged to Serve BRI,” *Global Times*, October 17, 2018.

<sup>67</sup> “China Bans Major Prayer Festival in Larung Gar for Third Consecutive Year,” *Radio Free Asia*, October 25, 2018; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 45.

<sup>68</sup> Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 42; Sang Jieja, “Tibetans Get Home Decor Order: Hang Xi, Mao Portraits,” *UCANews*, January 23, 2019; Tenzin Saldon, Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibetans Forced to Prostrate to Xi Jinping Pictures: Religious Repression in Tibet Accelerates,” January 19, 2019.

<sup>69</sup> “Tibetans Beaten, Detained in Kardze Over Dalai Lama Photos,” *Radio Free Asia*, July 29, 2019.

<sup>70</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>71</sup> Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 50; Ambika Choudhary Mahajan, “China Imparting ‘Patriotic Education’ to Tibetan Monks and Nuns Infuriates Region’s Religious Leaders,” *Firstpost.com*, April 8, 2019.

<sup>72</sup> Liu Caiyu, “30,000 Monks and Nuns in Tibet Take Exams on Laws,” *Global Times*, March 26, 2019. According to the Chinese official news outlet *Global Times*, the tests reinforce the idea that “national laws are superior to religious regulations, and abiding by the law comes ahead of adhering to religious discipline.” *Free Tibet*, “China Forces 30,000 Monks and Nuns to Take Exams on Chinese Law,” May 23, 2019. The workshops require three to five years of political education on China’s history, laws, policies, and regulations on religion. According to *Free Tibet*, the exams were administered at Gaden, Drepung, and Sera Monasteries in Lhasa municipality, Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR), among other sites in the TAR.

<sup>73</sup> Human Rights Watch (HRW), “China: Tibetan Children Banned from Classes,” January 30, 2019. HRW provided an official copy (Tibetan language) and an unofficial English translation of the Nangchen county notice proscribing classes taught by monks.

<sup>74</sup> Tenzin Saldon, Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibetans Forced to Prostrate to Xi Jinping Pictures: Religious Repression in Tibet Accelerates,” January 19, 2019; *Free Tibet*, “Chinese Order Tibetans to Put Shrines to Xi Jinping and Party Leaders in Their Homes,” January 22, 2019.

<sup>75</sup> Li Zaili, “Authorities Use Welfare Payments Against Tibetan Buddhists,” *Bitter Winter*, January 18, 2019.

<sup>76</sup> For information on self-immolations in previous reporting years, see CECC, *2018 Annual Report*, October 10, 2018, 294–95; CECC, *2017 Annual Report*, October 5, 2017, 301–02; CECC, *2016 Annual Report*, October 6, 2016. For additional information on self-immolations in Tibetan autonomous areas of China, see Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 20.

<sup>77</sup> Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 20; International Campaign for Tibet, “Self-immolations,” accessed July 2, 2019.

<sup>78</sup> Central Tibetan Administration, “Photos of 2012 Tibetan Self-Immolators Identified,” May 22, 2019; International Campaign for Tibet, “Self-Immolation Fact Sheet,” December 10, 2018; International Campaign for Tibet, “Brave Solo Protests Show Tibetans’ Remarkable Courage and Steadfast Loyalty to the Dalai Lama,” October 11, 2018; Yangchen Dolma, “Two More Youths Set Themselves on Fire in Protest Against China’s Repression in Tibet,” *Tibet Post International*, December 14, 2018.

<sup>79</sup> International Campaign for Tibet, “Self-Immolation Fact Sheet,” December 10, 2018; “Liuwang Zangren aidao ji shengyuan zuixin zifenzhe” [Exiled Tibetans mourn and voice support for latest self-immolator], *Radio Free Asia*, November 9, 2018; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 21.

<sup>80</sup> “Liuwang Zangren aidao ji shengyuan zuixin zifenzhe” [Exiled Tibetans mourn and voice support for latest self-immolator], *Radio Free Asia*, November 9, 2018.

<sup>81</sup> Tinley Nyandak, “Tibetan Youth Self-Immolates Over China’s Tibet Policies,” *Voice of America*, December 10, 2018; Tenzin Sangmo, “Tibetan Monk Beaten Up, Arrested in Ngaba for Protest,” *Phayul*, December 14, 2018.

<sup>82</sup> Tinley Nyandak, “Tibetan Youth Self-Immolates Over China’s Tibet Policies,” *Voice of America*, December 10, 2018; Yangchen Dolma, “Tibetan Youth Sets Himself on Fire in Eastern Tibet to Protest China’s Rule,” *Tibet Post International*, December 9, 2018; “Tibetan Man in Ngaba Stages Self-Immolation Protest,” *Radio Free Asia*, December 9, 2018.

<sup>83</sup> Tenzin Sangmo, “Tibetan Monk Beaten Up, Arrested in Ngaba for Protest,” *Phayul*, December 14, 2018.

<sup>84</sup> “New Self-Immolations, Protest Reported in Sichuan’s Ngaba,” *Radio Free Asia*, December 14, 2018; “Tibetan Man in Ngaba Stages Self-Immolation Protest,” *Radio Free Asia*, December 9, 2018; Yangchen Dolma, “Tibetan Youth Sets Himself on Fire in Eastern Tibet to Protest China’s Rule,” *Tibet Post International*, December 9, 2018.

<sup>85</sup> State Council Information Office, “National Human Rights Action Plan of China (2016–2020),” August 2016, reprinted in *Xinhua*, September 29, 2016, sec. III(1); PRC Constitution, passed and effective December 4, 1982 (amended March 11, 2018), arts. 4, 121; *Zhonghua Renmin Gongheguo Minzu Quyu Zizhi Fa* [PRC Regional Ethnic Autonomy Law], issued May 31, 1984, amended and effective February 28, 2001, arts. 10, 21, 37; State Council, *Guowuyuan*



Shishi “*Zhonghua Renmin Gongheguo Minzu Quyu Zizhi Fa*” *Ruogan Guiding* [Certain Provisions on Implementing the “PRC Regional Ethnic Autonomy Law”, issued May 19, 2005, effective May 31, 2005, art. 22; *Zhonghua Renmin Gongheguo Jiaoyu Fa* [PRC Education Law], passed March 18, 1995, amended August 27, 2009, December 27, 2015, effective June 1, 2016, art. 12. China’s Constitution and the PRC Regional Ethnic Autonomy Law provide nominal protection for the use of minority languages. The State Council Provisions on Implementing the PRC Regional Ethnic Autonomy Law affirm the freedom to use and develop minority languages, but also place emphasis on the use of Mandarin by promoting “bilingual” education and bilingual teaching staff.

<sup>86</sup>State Council Information Office, “Democratic Reform in Tibet—Sixty Years On,” March 2019, 26.

<sup>87</sup>“Tibetan Monasteries in Nangchen Banned from Teaching Language to Young Tibetans,” *Radio Free Asia*, January 30, 2019.

<sup>88</sup>Tenzin Dharpo, “Tibetan Language Language Rights Advocate Tashi Wangchuk Appeals Against 5-Year Prison Term,” *Phayul*, June 20, 2018. For more information on Tashi Wangchuk, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2016-00077.

<sup>89</sup>Tenzin Dharpo, “Tibetan Language Advocate Denied Right to Appeal at Higher Court,” *Phayul*, January 30, 2019; Independent Chinese PEN Center, “Lushi huijian Zhaxi Wense zai ci yu zu, liyou shi min’gan anjian teshu duidai” [Lawyer again blocked from meeting with Tashi Wangchuk, reason [given] is “special treatment for a sensitive case”], August 2, 2019.

<sup>90</sup>“Jailed Tibetan Language Rights Advocate Is Refused Visits from His Lawyers,” *Radio Free Asia*, August 2, 2019.

<sup>91</sup>Human Rights Watch, “China,” in *World Report 2019: Events of 2018*, 2019, 144.

<sup>92</sup>Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor, U.S. Department of State, “Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2018—China (Includes Tibet, Hong Kong, and Macau),” March 13, 2019, 73.

<sup>93</sup>*Ibid.*, 80.

<sup>94</sup>Tenzin Dalha, “How WeChat Conquered Tibet,” *The Diplomat*, July 16, 2019. See also “Tibetan Man Detained for Sharing Dalai Lama Photo on WeChat,” *Radio Free Asia*, August 26, 2019.

<sup>95</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, “China Detains Tibetan Anti-Corruption Activist on Politicised Charge of ‘Provoking Trouble,’” December 20, 2018. For more information on Sengdra, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2016-00353.

<sup>96</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, “Teenage Monk and Blogger Detained at Undisclosed Location After Staging Solo Protest,” September 25, 2018. For more information on Tenzin Geleg, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2018-00472.

<sup>97</sup>“Three Tibetan Monks Detained after Launching Solo Protests in Ngaba,” *Radio Free Asia*, September 24, 2018. For more information on Dorje Rabten, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2018-00471.

<sup>98</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, “Teen Monk Disappears into Chinese Police Custody After Staging a Solo Protest Calling for Freedom in Tibet,” December 15, 2018; “New Self-Immolations, Protest Reported in Sichuan’s Ngaba,” *Radio Free Asia*, December 14, 2018. For more information on Sanggye Gyatso, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2018-00697.

<sup>99</sup>Tenzin Sangmo, “Three Tibetans Detained for Praying for the Release of the Panchen Lama,” *Phayul*, April 30, 2019; “Wei Banchan Lama qifu er zao bu, liang ming Zangren zai Xizang Shiqu zao panxing” [Arrested for praying for Panchen Lama, two Tibetans sentenced in Sersbul, Tibet], *Voice of Tibet*, May 9, 2019; “Three Tibetans Are Detained for Calling for Panchen Lama’s Release,” *Radio Free Asia*, April 30, 2019.

<sup>100</sup>Tenzin Sangmo, “Three Tibetans Detained for Praying for the Release of the Panchen Lama,” *Phayul*, April 30, 2019; “Wei Banchan Lama qifu er zao zu, liang ming Zangren zai Xizang Shiqu zao panxing” [Arrested for praying for Panchen Lama, two Tibetans sentenced in Sersbul, Tibet], *Voice of Tibet*, May 9, 2019; “Three Tibetans Are Detained for Calling for Panchen Lama’s Release,” *Radio Free Asia*, April 30, 2019. For more information on Wangchen, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2019-00174.

<sup>101</sup>“Tibetan Man, Aunt Sentenced for Panchen Lama Protest in Sichuan,” *Radio Free Asia*, May 8, 2019; Free Tibet, “Tibetans Sentenced to Prison after Panchen Lama Gathering,” May 9, 2019. For more information on Drolkar, see the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database record 2019-00178.

<sup>102</sup>Tom Phillips, “Jokhang Temple: Fire Engulfs Ancient ‘Heart’ of Tibetan Buddhism,” *Guardian*, February 17, 2018; “Fire Put Out in Jokhang Temple in China’s Tibet,” *Xinhua*, February 17, 2018; CECC, *2018 Annual Report*, October 10, 2018, 298.

<sup>103</sup>Free Tibet, “The Jokhang Fire Four Months On,” June 22, 2018.

<sup>104</sup>Free Tibet, “The Jokhang Fire Four Months On,” June 22, 2018; Nithin Coca, “China’s Digital Wall Around Tibet,” *Coda Story*, May 16, 2019.

<sup>105</sup>See e.g., “Jokhang Temple Holds Tibetan Calligraphy Exhibition for First Time,” *Xinhua*, April 30, 2019; “Efforts Underway to Map Tibet’s Jokhang Temple,” *Xinhua*, April 7, 2019; “U.S. Ambassador Urges China to Talk to the Dalai Lama,” *Reuters*, May 25, 2019.

<sup>106</sup>“Chinese Authorities Detain Tibetan Student Who Decried Lack of Government Jobs in Tibet,” *Radio Free Asia*, April 16, 2019; Karma Tenzin, “China’s White Paper on Education in Tibet: The Missing Facts,” *Bitter Winter*, May 9, 2019. For more information on Sonam Lhundrub, see the Commission Political Prisoner Database record 2019-00175.

<sup>107</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 25–26; International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR), adopted by UN General Assembly resolution 2200A (XXI) of December 16, 1966, entry into force March 23, 1976, art. 12; United Nations Treaty Collection, Chapter IV, Human Rights, International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, accessed July 23, 2019. China has signed but not ratified the ICCPR.

## Tibet

<sup>108</sup>“Chinese Authorities Tighten Restrictions in Qinghai amid Tibetan Uprising Anniversaries,” *Radio Free Asia*, March 14, 2019; “Tibetan Migration into India Down to a Trickle,” *Voice of America*, July 2, 2018; UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018, paras. 64, 67.

<sup>109</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 25.

<sup>110</sup>“Tibetan Passport Restrictions Limit Attendance at Dalai Lama Prayer Gathering,” *Radio Free Asia*, December 26, 2018; Free Tibet, “Hundreds of Tibetans Ordered to Immediately Return from Pilgrimage Sites,” January 4, 2019.

<sup>111</sup>Tenzin Saldon, Central Tibetan Administration, “Travel Restrictions on Tibetans Persist despite International Outcry against China,” January 2, 2019.

<sup>112</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 26.

<sup>113</sup>Tenzin Saldon, Central Tibetan Administration, “Travel Restrictions on Tibetans Persist despite International Outcry against China,” January 2, 2019; Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 26. See also CECC, *2018 Annual Report*, October 8, 2018, 298–99.

<sup>114</sup>Bureau of Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor, U.S. Department of State, “Country Reports on Human Rights Practices for 2018—China (Includes Tibet, Hong Kong, and Macau),” March 13, 2019, 83.

<sup>115</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>116</sup>Tibetan Centre for Human Rights and Democracy, *Annual Report 2018—Human Rights Situation in Tibet*, May 2019, 26.

<sup>117</sup>*Ibid.*

<sup>118</sup>UN Human Rights Council, Summary of Stakeholders’ Submissions on China, Report of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights, A/HRC/WG.6/31/CHN/3\*, September 3, 2018.

<sup>119</sup>Zhang Zhihao and Cui Jia, “Tibet to Get Five National Parks,” *China Daily*, March 12, 2019; Stephen Chen, “China Plans World’s Biggest National Park on Tibetan Plateau,” *South China Morning Post*, April 22, 2017.

<sup>120</sup>International Campaign for Tibet, “Damming Tibet’s Rivers: New Threats to Tibetan Areas under UNESCO Protection,” May 30, 2019, 1; Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibet Was Never a Part of China, but the Middle Way Approach Remains a Viable Solution,” October 2018, 135, 142–43, 149, 151–53; Ambika Choudhary Mahajan, Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibetan Nomads Forcibly ‘Resettled’ by China Struggle with Loss of an Over 8,000-Year-Old Heritage,” April 6, 2019.

<sup>121</sup>*The Hindu Kush Himalaya Assessment: Mountains, Climate Change, Sustainability and People*, eds. Philippus Wester et al. (Cham: Springer Open, 2019), 23, 65; Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibet Was Never a Part of China, but the Middle Way Approach Remains a Viable Solution,” October 2018, 135, 138–42; Office of Tibet, “Backgrounder: Climate Action for Tibet,” accessed July 20, 2019. See also Michael Buckley, *Meltdown in Tibet* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 106–8.

<sup>122</sup>Dechen Palmo, “The World’s Third Pole Is Melting,” *The Diplomat*, March 28, 2019; Central Tibetan Administration, “Tibet Was Never a Part of China, but the Middle Way Approach Remains a Viable Solution,” October 2018; Office of Tibet, “Backgrounder: Climate Action for Tibet,” accessed July 3, 2019.

<sup>123</sup>Tenzin Sangmo, “World Water Day: China’s Damming of Rivers in Tibet Continues to Violate the Water Rights of the Downstream Countries,” *Phayul*, March 22, 2019. See also Michael Buckley, *Meltdown in Tibet* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 167–87.

<sup>124</sup>“Capital City Lhasa Leads Poverty Reduction in Tibet,” *Xinhua*, January 7, 2019; State Council Information Office, “Great Leap: Democratic Reform in Tibet—Sixty Years On,” March 2019, 24.

<sup>125</sup>“Tibetan Nomads in Chamdo Forced from Their Land in Resettlement Scheme,” *Radio Free Asia*, January 23, 2019.

<sup>126</sup>“Tibetan Villagers Forced from Their Homes in Gonjo County,” *Radio Free Asia*, April 4, 2019.

<sup>127</sup>“Tibetans Relocated from Ancestral Land Face Hardships in City Life,” *Radio Free Asia*, May 1, 2019.

<sup>128</sup>“Tibetan Villagers Evicted to Make Room for New Airport,” *Radio Free Asia*, May 16, 2019.

<sup>129</sup>“Four Tibetan Monks Detained Over Land Protest in Ngaba,” *Radio Free Asia*, September 17, 2018; “Xizang Aba wu ming sengren buman zhengfu shigong yingxiang siyuan hou zao jingfang jubu” [Five Tibetan monks from Aba detained by police after [expressing] dissatisfaction with government construction effect on monastery], *Voice of Tibet*, September 18, 2018. For more information on the five monks, see the following records in the Commission’s Political Prisoner Database: 2018-00466 on Nyida, 2018-00467 on Kalsang, 2018-00468 on Nesang, 2018-00469 on Choeje, and 2018-00470 on Shakya.

<sup>130</sup>“Tibetan Villagers Evicted to Make Room For New Airport,” *Radio Free Asia*, May 16, 2019.